

Zumbiehl Janine CHBS

From: Atkin John CHBS
Sent: Montag, 8. Oktober 2007 11:02
To: Sullivan Jonathan Dale CHBS
Subject: FW: Dole Press Release on PQ
Categories: paraquat
Attachments: Dole paraquat

From: Brown Richard Anthony CHBS
Sent: Montag, 8. Oktober 2007 10:33
To: Atkin John CHBS; Scott David CHBS; Dias Andre CHBS
Cc: Diriwachter Georg CHBS
Subject: RE: Dole Press Release on PQ

Dear John,

In answer to your questions, the Court of First Instance decision has obviously brought the issue of paraquat higher up Dole's agenda, but it is the subsequent discussion in the media on the possible association with Parkinson's Disease that has pushed their hand. Dole were made fully aware of the Syngenta position on PD and also on the position of the German Authorities when this information became available. Their view on this risk is coloured by the current law suit concerning the use of DBCP between 1967 and 1980 and claims of sterility in workers. Though they believe that there is insufficient evidence to demonstrate that this has happened, we believe that they are somewhat pessimistic about the progress of the case and have become increasingly risk averse as a result. Their Executive Vice President, General Counsel and Corporate Secretary Michael Carter is the key player here. There have been a number of conversations concerning this topic and escalating the debate was suggested a week ago when the technical arguments were finally appearing ineffective (attached) and we were informed that there would be a communication in the next few weeks. Late on Friday evening, David was informed that this may be sooner rather than later.

When David Scott visited Dole in July, he was told that they had stopped using paraquat in their banana plantations earlier this year, under pressure from certain European customers and went over to a "weed-wiper" system using glyphosate. The EvB campaign could well have had a role in this as their target was consumers and retailers. However, Dole continue to use paraquat in Costa Rican pineapple in order to control the Stable Fly breeding in pineapple trash, as they are required to do by law. Though the indications were last week that they would continue to do this, we will not know until we see the release. It was requested by David on Friday that we get to see an early draft and I have repeated that request today, also that someone from their executive is prepared to talk first.

Rs - Richard

From: Atkin John CHBS
Sent: 08 October 2007 07:44
To: Brown Richard Anthony CHBS; Scott David CHBS; Dias Andre CHBS
Cc: Diriwachter Georg CHBS
Subject: FW: Dole Press Release on PQ

Further questions: did this have nothing to do with the EU decision? I know we were working closely with them but this decision seems to have come out of the blue. No chance to elevate discussions to more senior levels - were we under-estimating the risk, how much has the actions of EvB got to do with it? . Were they made fully aware of our position on Parkinson's and the German assessment? - John

From: Schoenmaeckers Medard CHBS
Sent: Sonntag, 7. Oktober 2007 19:30
To: Atkin John CHBS; Brown Richard Anthony CHBS; Quintart Alain-Dominique FRSC; Tilger Carsten CHBS; Ridley Caspar CHBS; Dias Andre CHBS; Smith Lewis CHBS
Cc: French Dave CHBS; Scott David CHBS; Rodrigues Rose BRSP; Hernandez Jaime COBO; Estrada Eduardo BRSP; Sullivan Jonathan Dale CHBS; Casabianca Pablo COBO; Pisk Davor SGSG; Hull Sarah USWS; Burt Anne USWS

09.10.2007

CONFIDENTIAL - PARAQUAT LITIGATION

Case ID: 220300429

SYNG-PQ-29316441

Subject: RE: Dole Press Release on PQ

Based on the available information sofar, I attach a standby statement and some Q&As for use if and when Dole issues their release. Parts in italics need your input or can only be finalized when we have their final release. It is therefore important that we get this well before they issue it. Richard/David, can you ask Dole who their media relations person is, so that we can call them tomorrow to ask for it?

As I am travelling tomorrow, send your comments also to Sabine Hoffman. She will process your input and finalize the doc.

Best,
Médard

09.10.2007

CONFIDENTIAL - PARAQUAT LITIGATION

Case ID: 220300429

SYNG-PQ-29316442

Zumbiehl Janine CHBS

From: Scott David CHBS
Sent: Montag, 1. Oktober 2007 07:14
To: Dias Andre CHBS
Cc: Brown Richard Anthony CHBS
Subject: Dole paraquat
Attachments: Dole visit 19th July 2007

Andre,

As promised

In the most recent in a series of telephone conversations with John T. Mirenda, Vice President Research and Development, Dole Fresh Fruit International Ltd, San Jose, Costa Rica I was told that despite his best efforts and to his considerable frustration "he had been rebuffed" and Dole were going to issue a statement in the next few weeks stating their withdrawal from paraquat with the exception of the use in Pine Apple in Costa Rica. Until such time as they could find a replacement.

This decision he said was taken at the highest level within Dole. The key players at Dole corporate are Dr Farewell Vice President R&D and Dr Castro.

The concern that overwhelms the senior management is the threat of a class action such as they are now experiencing with a 30 year old practise of putting DBCP, a nematocides in the irrigation water on their Banana plantations.

<http://www.latimes.com/news/local/la-me-pest20jul20,1,1284209.story?coll=la-headlines-california&ctrack=1&cset=true>
They are also going to adopt The Rainforest Alliance protocol more widely with the consequent issues for Gramoxone and Bravo.

He wanted us to jointly explore the use of Diquat as a replacement.

John is as much as he can be a good supporter of paraquat and he understands the issues extremely well. He is happy to talk again on the issue. He said if we wanted to influence the decision we'd have to be quick and his influence would be very limited having had his say.

At a minimum we ought to be contacting Dole corporate and I could try and get agreement to a conversation between a Syngenta senior manager and Tom Farewell.

It also occurs that we should try understand what their press release will say and influence it to ensure its not too damaging as a condition of working with us in the future.

Regards

David

+41 (61) 3236983 office
+41 (79) 7774024 mobile
Syngenta Crop Protection AG
Werk Rosental
Schwarzwaldallee 215
CH-4058 Basel
Switzerland

visit www.paraquat.com for all your paraquat information needs

09.10.2007

CONFIDENTIAL - PARAQUAT LITIGATION

Case ID: 220300429

SYNG-PQ-29316443

Zumbiehl Janine CHBS

From: Scott David CHBS
Sent: Samstag, 21. Juli 2007 18:52
To: Soto Alvaro CRSJ; Coto Boris CRSJ; Dias Andre CHBS; Estevez Jose CRSJ; Hernandez Jaime COBO; Brown Richard Anthony CHBS
Subject: Dole visit 19th July 2007
Attachments: CIMG1496.JPG

Dole
 John Mirenda VP R&D
 Rudy Amador Environmental Affairs LATAM
 Tom Farewell Corporate via telecom
 Ian Velez Quality Assurance Manager Corporate via telecom
 Syngenta
 Boris Coto, Stewardship
 Alvaro Soto, Marketing

Visited Pineapple and Banana farms in the morning near Quapeles(spelling?) , north of San Jose
 PM Meeting in offices in San Jose

Pineapple is the profitable growth crop for Dole with the new sweet variety expanding the market for the fruit in Europe and Asia
 Banana remains important but margins are under threat from expanding market access by other producers.

Pine apple - a magic paraquat story - essential for post harvest land preparation- popular elsewhere for desiccation of crop residues. In addition in CR the Stable fly is a major pest of cattle that thrives in the decaying pineapple crop trash as it ferments. MoA have ordinances in place to require Pine Apple growers to control the Stable fly with a range of measures. Initially it was so bad the Cattle men wanted the pineapple farms shut down. Dole use paraquat followed by shedding and disking. Fly traps are also mandatory for monitoring potential outbreaks and any build up is treated by spraying with insecticides Mocap currently used. see picture above.
 The farm we visited was a recently converted from Banana underlining the importance of this crop for Dole. They are expanding on the Pacific coast and we saw a lot of planting materials on their way to new farms. The way the crop is farmed applications are by tractor mounted sprayers.

Boris to get this Pineapple story written up for publication in Spanish with English translation. Please agree a budget with me.

Banana - stopped using paraquat in 2007. Have move to weed wipers using glyphosate. Cuts rates and makes application easier. Encouraging ground cover to reduce erosion, Aware of resistance issue. Will be testing paraquat but understand the limitations with very low or no additional water. Strong corporate direction to cut use of CPPs where ever possible. This was a good example.

Office discussions - Court of First Instance (CFI) annex 1 decision prompted 5 good questions from Ivan. All answered within the messages already issued.
 Ivan's comment was "as long as we have a MRL in place in Europe we can export". Mirenda commented that he was surprised by this approach as he would have thought the policy of no use of products banned in EU or USA would have been invoked. This probably reflects the importance placed on paraquat in managing the pineapple crop residues. I.e. I have a policy which becomes more of a "guideline" if my economic interest are put at risk.
 INTEON story well received but suggestions for trials work deferred by Mirenda until more clarity on the CFI decision.
 This indicates Dole are more risk averse than Del Monte. Dole were hit hard by claims for human health damages following the wide spread use of nematocides in the irrigation water some years ago. They are still facing litigation from families and second generations claiming to be affected so maybe its not so surprising.
 Dole have a similar policy to Del Monte using ISO standards EUREPGAP legal products and the protocols of their retail customers.

Next steps

Given that both Dole and Del Monte find paraquat vital for their most profitable growth crop could we get some sort of alliance with them to promote INTEON as the alternative to paraquat. When suggesting this to Mirenda he mentioned Chiquita as the stick with which they get beaten on the paraquat issue. Chiquita using the Rain Forest Alliance (RFA) and the PAN list restrictions. However Chiquita are not big in Pineapple so don't face the paraquat imperative. If we can get the RFA to buy into INTEON as well for bananas then we could include Chiquita. This could be independent of any regulatory standard and INTEON becomes a secondary standard for key food companies.
 Will pursue the RFA angle with Chris Willie.

09.10.2007

CONFIDENTIAL - PARAQUAT LITIGATION

Case ID: 220300429

SYNG-PQ-29316444

Dole were very complimentary about our solid support for paraquat over the years. "This is the 3rd generation of Syngenta people we have met supporting paraquat".

We need to keep in touch with Dole, they were keen to get more regular product information and most urgently our position on the developing CFI judgement.

A good visit.

David

+41 (61) 3236983 office
+41 (79) 7774024 mobile
Syngenta Crop Protection AG
Werk Rosental
Schwarzwaldallee 215
CH-4058 Basel
Switzerland

visit www.paraquat.com for all your paraquat information needs

09.10.2007

CONFIDENTIAL - PARAQUAT LITIGATION

Case ID: 220300429

SYNG-PQ-29316445